

PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON &amp; GARRISON LLP

1285 AVENUE OF THE AMERICAS  
NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10019-6064

TELEPHONE (212) 373-3000

LLOYD K. GARRISON (1946-1991)  
RANDOLPH E. PAUL (1946-1956)  
SIMON H. RIFKIND (1950-1995)  
LOUIS S. WEISS (1927-1950)  
JOHN F. WHARTON (1927-1977)UNIT 5201, FORTUNE FINANCIAL CENTER  
5 DONGSANHUAN ZHONGLU  
CHAOYANG DISTRICT, BEIJING 100020, CHINA  
TELEPHONE (86-10) 5828-6300SUITES 3601 – 3606 & 3610  
36/F, GLOUCESTER TOWER  
THE LANDMARK  
15 QUEEN'S ROAD, CENTRAL  
HONG KONG  
TELEPHONE (852) 2846-0300

WRITER'S DIRECT DIAL NUMBER

(212) 373-3250

WRITER'S DIRECT FACSIMILE

(212) 492-0250

WRITER'S DIRECT E-MAIL ADDRESS

lreisner@paulweiss.com

ALDER CASTLE  
10 NOBLE STREET  
LONDON EC2V 7JU, UNITED KINGDOM  
TELEPHONE (44 20) 7367 1600FUKOKU SEIMEI BUILDING  
2-2 UCHISAIWAICHO 2-CHOME  
CHIYODA-KU, TOKYO 100-0011, JAPAN  
TELEPHONE (81-3) 3597-8101TORONTO-DOMINION CENTRE  
77 KING STREET WEST, SUITE 3100  
P.O. BOX 226  
TORONTO, ONTARIO M5K 1J3  
TELEPHONE (416) 504-05202001 K STREET, NW  
WASHINGTON, DC 20006-1047  
TELEPHONE (202) 223-7300500 DELAWARE AVENUE, SUITE 200  
POST OFFICE BOX 32  
WILMINGTON, DE 19899-0032  
TELEPHONE (302) 655-4410

October 25, 2021

**Via ECF**Honorable Edgardo Ramos  
United States District Judge  
United States Courthouse  
40 Foley Square  
New York, NY 10007Re: *United States v. Neil Cole*,  
19 Cr. 869 (ER)

Dear Judge Ramos:

Although we understand that Your Honor's general practice is to provide a copy of the indictment to the jury, we respectfully submit that, under the circumstances of this case, submitting the indictment to the jury is unnecessary and unfairly prejudicial. The 37-page, speaking indictment is not a "plain, concise" statement of the "essential facts constituting the offense charged." Fed. R. Crim. P. 7(c). It is a piece of persuasive writing setting forth the government's interpretation of the evidence, with descriptive headings and extraneous detail designed to persuade the reader of Mr. Cole's guilt. At a minimum, the jury should receive only a redacted version of the indictment that is limited to the statutory charges.

The Second Circuit has cautioned against sending indictments into the jury room, "particularly when the indictment does not merely state the statutory charges against the defendant, but additionally contains a running narrative of the government's version of the facts of the case, including detailed allegations of facts not necessary for the jury to find in order to address the elements of the charged offenses." *United States v. Esso*, 684 F.3d 347, 352 n.5 (2d Cir. 2012); *see also United States v. Van Dyke*, 14 F.3d 415, 423 (8th Cir. 1994) ("[T]he indictment, as the government's formal charging document, gave the jury a one-sided view of the case."); *Getchell v. United States*, 282 F.2d 681, 689–90

MATTHEW W. ABBOTT  
EDWARD T. ADLERMAN  
JACOB A. ADLERSTEIN  
JUSTIN ANDERSON  
ALLAN J. ARFFA  
JONATHAN B. BERTOR  
ROBERT A. ATKINS  
SCOTT A. BARSHAY  
PAUL M. BASTA  
J. STEVEN BAUGHMAN  
LYNN B. BARD  
CRAIG A. BENSON  
JOSEPH J. BIAL  
BRUCE BIRENBAUM  
H. CHRISTOPHER BOEHNING  
BRIAN BOLIN  
ANGELO BONVINO  
ROBERT A. BRITTON  
DAVID W. BROWN  
WALTER BROWN\*\*  
SUSANNA M. BUERGEL  
JESSICA S. CAREY  
DAVID CARMONA  
GEOFFREY R. CHEPIGA  
ELLEN N. CHING  
WILLIAM A. CLAREMAN  
LEWIS R. CLAY  
YAHONNES CLEARY  
JAY COHEN  
KELLEY A. CORNISH  
CHRISTOPHER J. CUMMINGS  
THOMAS V. DE LA BASTIDE III  
MEREDITH DEARBORN\*\*  
ARIEL J. DECKELBAUM  
KAREN L. DUBOIS  
ALICE BELISLE EATON  
ANDREW J. EHRLICH  
GREGORY A. EZRING  
ROSS A. FIELDSTON  
ANDREW C. FINCH  
BRAD J. FINKELSTEIN  
BRIAN P. FINNEGAN  
ROBERTO J. FINZI  
PETER E. FISCH  
HARRIS FISCHMAN  
ANDREW J. FOLEY  
VICTORIA S. FORRESTER  
HARRIS B. FREIDUS  
CHRISTOPHER D. FREY  
MANUEL S. FREY  
ANDREW L. GAINES  
KENNETH A. GALLO  
MICHAEL E. GERTZMAN  
ADAM M. GIVERTZ  
SALVATORE GOGLIORMELLA  
NEIL GOLDMAN  
MATTHEW B. GOLDSTEIN  
ROBERTO J. GONZALEZ\*  
CATHERINE L. GOODALL  
CHARLES H. GOODE, JR.  
ANDREW G. GORDON  
BRIAN S. GRIEVE  
UDI GROFMAN  
NICHOLAS GROOMBRIDGE  
BRUCE A. GUTENPLAN  
MELINDA HAAG\*  
ALAN S. HALPERIN  
CLAUDIA HAMMERMAN  
BRIAN S. HERMANN  
JOSHUA HILL  
MICHELE HIRSHMAN  
JARRETT R. HOFFMAN  
ROBERT E. HOLO  
DAVID S. HUNTINGTON  
AMRAN HUSSEIN  
LORETTA A. IPPOLITO  
WILLIAM A. ISAACSON\*  
JAREN JANGHORANI  
BRIAN M. JANSON  
BEH C. JOHNSON  
BRAD S. KARP  
PATRICK N. KARSNITZ  
JOHN C. KENNEDY  
BRIAN KIM  
KYLE J. KIMPLER  
ALEXIA D. KORBERG  
ALAN W. KORNBERG

DANIEL J. KRAMER  
JEFFREY KRAUSE  
CAITH KUSHNER  
DAVID K. LAKHDHIR  
GREGORY F. LAUFER  
BRIAN C. LAVIN  
XIAOYU GREG LIU  
RANDY LUSKEY\*\*  
LORETTA E. LYNCH  
JEFFREY D. MARELL  
MARCO V. MASOTTI  
DAVID W. MAYO  
ELIZABETH R. MCCOLM  
JEAN M. MCLOUGHLIN  
ALVARO MEMBRILLERA  
MARK F. MENDELSON  
CLAUDINE MEREDITH-GOUJON  
JUDIE NG SHORTELL\*  
CATHERINE NYARADY  
JANE B. O'BRIEN  
BRAD R. OKUN  
LYNDSEY B. PARKS  
ANDREW M. PARLEN  
DANIELLE C. PENHALL  
CHARLES J. PESSANT  
JESSICA A. PHILLIPS\*  
AUSTIN POLLET\*\*  
VALERIE E. RADWANER  
JEFFREY J. RECHER  
RICHARD A. REISNER  
LORIN L. REISNER  
JEANNIE S. RHEE\*  
WALTER G. RICCIARDI  
ANDREW N. ROSENBERG  
JUSTIN ROSENBERG  
JACQUELINE P. RUBIN  
CHARLES F. "RICK" RULE\*  
RAPHAEL M. RUSSO  
ELIZABETH M. SACKSTEDER  
JEFFREY D. SAFERSTEIN  
JEFFREY B. SAMUELS  
KENNETH M. SCHNEIDER  
ROBERT B. SCHUMER  
JOHN M. SCOTT  
BRIAN SCRIVANI  
KYLE T. SEIFRIED  
KANNON K. SHANMUGAM\*  
CULLEN L. SINCLAIR  
AUDRA J. SLOWWAY  
SCOTT M. SONTAG  
SARAH STASNY  
TARUN M. STEWART  
ERIC ALAN STONE  
AIDAN SYNNOTT  
BRETTE TANNENBAUM  
RICHARD C. TARLOWE  
DAVID TARR  
MONICA K. THURMOND  
DANIEL J. TOAL  
LAURA C. TURANO  
CONRAD VAN LOGGERENBERG  
RISHNA VEERARAGHAVAN  
JEREMY M. VEIT  
LIZA M. VELAZQUEZ  
MICHAEL VOGEL  
AMY J. WAHBEH  
JOHN WEBER  
LAWRENCE G. WEE  
THEODORE V. WELLS, JR.  
LINDSEY L. WIERMSA  
STEVEN J. WILLIAMS  
LAWRENCE I. WITDORCHIC  
AUSTIN WITT  
MARK B. WLAZLO  
ADAM WOLLSTEIN  
JULIA TARVER MASON WOOD  
JENNIFER H. WU  
BETTY YAP\*  
JORDAN E. YARETT  
KAYE N. YOSHINO  
TONG YU  
TRACEY A. ZACCONE  
TAURIE M. ZEITZER  
T. ROBERT ZOCHOWSKI, JR.

\*NOT ADMITTED TO THE NEW YORK BAR  
\*ADMITTED ONLY TO THE CALIFORNIA BAR

Honorable Edgardo Ramos

2

(5th Cir. 1960) (“[T]he long recital of the prosecution's theory of fraud contained in the indictment tended to prejudice the defendants.”); *United States v. Ogbazion*, No. 3:15-CR-104, 2021 WL 3847829, at \*17 (S.D. Ohio Aug. 27, 2021) (recognizing that “error may arise from allowing a deliberating jury to see and consider superfluous information, unnecessary to its consideration of the offense at issue”).

Accordingly, a number of courts in this District have adopted a general “practice [not] to give ‘speaking’ indictments to the jury,” while others do not send back any indictment, whether speaking or not. *United States v. Tuzman*, 301 F. Supp. 3d 430, 453 (S.D.N.Y. 2017) (Gardephe, J.); see *United States v. Butler*, 351 F. Supp. 2d 121, 124 (S.D.N.Y. 2004) (Lynch, J.); Trial Tr. at 2107–08, *United States v. Petit*, No. 19 Cr. 850 (JSR) (S.D.N.Y. Nov. 11, 2020), ECF NO. 185. Given that the purpose of providing the indictment to the jury is “to facilitate deliberation,” *United States v. Shellef*, 732 F. Supp. 2d 42, 82 (E.D.N.Y. 2010), there is no reason to include extraneous material that would not assist jurors in keeping straight the different charges and the elements they contain. A redacted version limited to the statutory language would achieve that objective.

In addition to containing unnecessary detail, the indictment in this case includes allegations that are unsupported by the evidence and, in some instances, objectively false. The indictment alleges, for example, that Mr. Cole “touted Iconix’s consistent record of . . . meeting or exceeding Wall Street analyst consensus with respect to [revenue and EPS].” Indictment ¶ 12. We are aware of no factual basis for that claim, and there certainly is nothing in the trial record to support it. The indictment also makes the incorrect assertion that Seth Horowitz was the Chief Operating Officer at all times relevant to the indictment when, in fact, he did not become COO until April 2014. Further, the indictment includes express references to information that the Court excluded under Rule 403 due to the risk of unfair prejudice. See Indictment ¶ 64.

Rather than visibly redacting the indictment and thus “arous[ing] the jury’s curiosity, stimulat[ing] unwarranted speculation, and invit[ing] confusion in deliberations,” or redrafting the indictment from scratch to avoid visible redactions and thus drastically altering the charging instrument without resubmitting it to the grand jury, the best course is simply not to submit the indictment. *United States v. Fawwaz*, No. S7 98-CR-1023 LAK, 2015 WL 2114914, at \*3 (S.D.N.Y. May 6, 2015).

Accordingly, we respectfully submit that the Court should decline to provide a copy of the indictment to the jury or, at a minimum, provide only those portions reciting the relevant statutory language.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Lorin L. Reisner

Lorin L. Reisner

Richard C. Tarlowe